

Constance Barlas' White Paper on Horse Slaughter

My family owns and runs thoroughbred racehorses. Until recently, I never understood how different opinions could be cast on us because of that simple declaration. My father always loved the sport of racing and dreamed of owning his own horse. When my family went to “meet” our first horse, Ruscar, I can remember being mesmerized by the magnificence of the grey colt. I grew up with the mentality that horses were athletes. While I understood that they were a business venture, I never saw them as property because I never saw the horses treated without respect and compassion. I honestly believed all horses were fed peppermints on Saturday mornings after their workouts and pet for hours like ours were. I never imagined that people sent their horses to slaughter instead of putting them on a retirement farm or finding a loving home for them as a pony horse or jumper. However, maybe it was naïve to think that the industry as a whole functioned the same as my microcosmic universe. Maybe it was just easier to look into the eyes of my horses after their morning workouts when I saw the racing world with rose colored glasses and truly believed that the phrase “going to the glue factory” was a joke. Perhaps its better I know the harsh reality so that I can become be part of the solution.

We live in an age now where very little is truly discreet. Gone is the age of Seabiscuit, an equine hero, who became an unlikely champion and a symbol of hope to many US citizens during the Great Depression. A person could be hard pressed to find an image like one published in the Los Angeles Times, circa 1940, that emphatically announced “the cheering at Santa Anita was from the heart -- for the gallant old fellow is the kind of an animal that once you see him run, see him try, see that great heart of his nearly burst in an effort to get down to the wire, stays in your heart for all time.”ⁱ The use of the Internet and visual communication has made the dissemination of information rapid, and often graphic. ⁱⁱ To some degree, this has hurt racing terribly. ⁱⁱⁱ When faced with troubling images associated with the sport it is often just the perception that is the reality to the public. ^{iv} It does not matter if explanations for these situations exist if they only make sense to those of us within the industry. ^v What matters is what appears to be obvious to the average person. ^{vi} In recent years, horse racing has asked the public to continue embracing the sport as it has for centuries without offering plausible explanations for the shocking paradox that exists concerning the lack of care and the eventual demise of the poor performers. ^{vii} It is becoming painfully obvious that the irony has not been lost upon the general public. ^{viii}

The once hailed “Sport of Kings” has been forced to defend itself in this wake of criticism, mostly from those outside the sport, many with limited knowledge of thoroughbred breeding and racing. Groups with anti-racing agendas are targeting the

thoroughbred industry and they're finding the mainstream media to be sympathetic partners in their campaigns.ix Sadly some of the criticism on the practices of horseracing is deserved.

Recently its critics have touted the breakdown of Eight Belles after the [Kentucky Derby](#) as evidence that the sport is a cruel and inhumane endeavor that should be curtailed or outlawed. x The sight of a beautiful animal ending up like Eight Belles is emotionally disturbing enough to justify almost any angry outburst, reasoned or not. I personally take solace in the words of Laura Hillenbrand, author of the classic book, *Seabiscuit*, that “from even the greatest tragedy can come good.”xi Eight Belles' death, along with the deaths of two horses in the 2008 Rolex Kentucky Three-Day Event in Lexington have the horse industry, the media and the public asking serious questions about the welfare of horses and other systemic problems in horse racing today.xii The truth is, thoroughbred horse racing and breeding is a multi-billion-dollar agribusiness that employs hundreds of thousands. xiii Therefore it may be less helpful to listen to radical groups calling for the immediate end to Thoroughbred racing, but more important to listen to those who suggest the industry should closely examine itself and discuss ways to make the sport safer.xiv In this paper I will discuss the issues that the racing industry faces and the solutions that can, if properly carried out, help revive this sport and change the lives of thousands of horses.

Issues

In an interview with the Humane Society of the United States, Keith Dane, director of equine protection, has stated, “[w]e’re not opposed to all horse racing, but we do have issues with certain elements of horse races that are detrimental to horses, such as the racing of two-year-old horses and the use of drugs in horses.”xv Some other debatable issues include: horse slaughter, horse retirement welfare and inhumane breeding practices. Upon review it appears the problem is that all of these issues have become intertwined with one another, making it even harder to bring about reform.

Horses begin training or are already racing when their skeletal systems are still growing and are unprepared to handle the pressures of running on a hard track at high speeds.xvi Before reaching age three, the animals’ legs are not fully developed, which increases the chances for injury. xvii One study on injuries at racetracks concluded that one horse in every 22 races suffered an injury that prevented him or her from finishing a race, while another estimates that 800 thoroughbreds die each year in North America because of injuries.xviii Strained tendons or hairline fractures can be tough for veterinarians to diagnose, and the damage has the capability to go from minor to detrimental in one workout. xix Horses do not handle surgery well, as they tend to be disoriented when coming out of anesthesia, and they may fight casts or slings, possibly causing further injury.xx In an effort to keep injured and ailing racehorses on the track

for as long as possible, veterinarians give them drugs such as Lasix (which controls bleeding in the lungs), phenylbutazone (an anti-inflammatory), and corticosteroids (for pain and inflammation).^{xxi} While legal, these drugs can also mask pain or make a horse run faster, thus attributing to another common issue in the sport.^{xxii}

This leads to the question, is “[f]inding an American racehorse trained on the traditional hay, oats, and water impossible?”^{xxiii} There are trainers pumping horses full of illegal drugs every day,” says a former Churchill Downs public relations director, “[w]ith so much money on the line, people will do anything to make their horses run faster.”^{xxiv} An executive director of the Racing Medication and Testing Consortium said there “could be thousands” of illegal drugs used in the horse racing industry.^{xxv} For example, Morphine, which can keep a horse from feeling any pain from an injury, was suspected in the case of Be My Royal, who won a race while limping.^{xxvi} One trainer was suspended for using an Ecstasy-type drug in five horses, and another was kicked off racetracks for using clenbuterol and, in one case, for having the leg of a euthanized horse cut off “for research.”^{xxvii}

According to the Association of Racing Commissioners International, Rick Dutrow Jr., the trainer of Big Brown, the winner of this year’s Kentucky Derby, has been fined every year since 2000 for a horse doping situation.^{xxviii} In 2003, one of his horses tested positive for Mepivacaine, an illegal analgesic and he openly admits to giving his horses Winstrol, a steroid that is illegal for equine use in 10 states.^{xxix} Before Winstrol was banned in Pennsylvania, nearly 1,000 horses were tested for steroids and more than 60 percent tested positive.^{xxx} Big Brown’s veterinarian concedes that “without steroids, they’d lose some horses that can’t keep up the pace and race every three weeks or every month.”^{xxxi} Perhaps the even more disturbing part is that Dutrow has served various suspension times, ranging from 14 to 60 days, for these violations, yet he is still allowed to compete despite his repeated violations.^{xxxii}

Care for a single racehorse can cost as much as \$50,000 per year so many injured horses are euthanized in order to save the owners further veterinary fees and other expenses on horses that cannot race again.^{xxxiii} Barbaro, the 2006 Kentucky Derby champion, was euthanized after shattering his leg in the Preakness.^{xxxiv} At first, his owners spared no expense for his medical needs, but as the New York Times reported, “[m]any in the business have noted that had Barbaro not been the winner of the Kentucky Derby, he might have been destroyed after being injured.”^{xxxv} Another horse, Magic Man, stepped into an uneven section of a track and broke both front legs during a race at Saratoga Race Course.^{xxxvi} His owner had bought him for \$900,000, yet the horse hadn’t earned any money yet and wasn’t worth much as a stud, so he was euthanized.^{xxxvii} A lot of these injuries occur because the bones are already weak from the stress of persistent training long before their skeletal structures were mature enough. Joseph Dirico, the owner of a filly who suffered a heart attack and died mid-

race at Pimlico, said of her death, "I guess that's part of the game."^{xxxviii} That sentiment was echoed by the general manager of Virginia's Colonial Downs, where five horses died within eight days in 2007. ^{xxxix}"We're upset when it happens," he said, "but it's just part of the racing game." ^{xl}

Is it true that few racehorses are retired to pastures for pampering and visits from caring individuals after falling victim to injuries and end up meeting their horrific fate at a horse slaughterhouse? An astonishing figure of 70,000-100,000 horses are slaughtered each year and sent to foreign markets for human consumption, many without the knowledge of their former owners. ^{xli} On a conference call June 8, 2008, Chris Heyde, legislative representative of the National Horse Protection Coalition, revealed that about 17% of those horses are Thoroughbreds.^{xlii} For example, Ferdinand, winner of the Kentucky Derby in 1986 and Horse of the Year in 1987, spent eight years at various stud farms in Japan before he was sold to a slaughterhouse in 2002. ^{xliii} Exceller, a million-dollar racehorse who was inducted into the National Racing Museum's Hall of Fame, wound up in a slaughterhouse in Sweden in 1997 after his owner went bankrupt and decided he could no longer afford him.^{xliv} Since horsemen are always looking for pedigrees that produce smart, fast runners many argue that horse slaughter makes it economical for owners to over breed horses to try to produce faster, better horses for racing.

Because owners can make money from the brutal slaughter of their horses, they have an incentive to over breed. As seen with companion animals, thoroughbred owners have to watch out for "killer buyers." ^{xlv} In order to meet the demand for the foreign horse meat industry, kill buyers, and horse dealers who act either as kill buyers or work directly with kill buyers, have become quite adept in acquiring horses from unsuspecting sellers who assume their horses are going to good homes. ^{xlvi} These buyers often use misleading information to coax people into selling their horses for cheap prices, after which they are vanned straight to the slaughterhouses. ^{xlvii} In addition, thousands of horses are stolen each year, including two racehorses that were recently unlawfully taken from a barn at Thistledown to be sold on the slaughter market. ^{xlviii}

While no slaughterhouses are currently operating in the United State, a multimillion-dollar horsemeat export industry unfortunately still exists that sends tens of thousands of horses every year to Canada, Mexico, and Japan for slaughter. ^{xlix} One Colorado State University study found that of 1,348 horses sent to slaughter, 58 were known to be former racehorses. ^l Most horses that are sent to those facilities are forced to endure days of transport in cramped trailers with no access to water or food, and injuries are common. ^{li} A University of California, Davis, study of 306 horses destined for slaughter found that 60 of them sustained injuries during transport. ^{lii} Even worse, while veterinarians recommend that horses be offloaded for food and water every four hours while traveling, the U.S. Department of Agriculture allows horses to be shipped for 28 hours without a break. ^{liii}

Horses are subject to the same method of slaughter as cows, but since horses are generally not accustomed to being herded, they tend to thrash about in order to avoid the pneumatic gun that is supposed to render them unconscious before their throats are cut.^{liv} Arthur Hancock, breeder and racer of three Derby winners and owner of Stone Farm near Paris, Ky., who has visited one of the slaughterhouses in person. "You can hear the horses screaming when they smell the blood," he said. It's a horrible, degrading, ruthless process."^{lv}

Horse slaughter is an intensely debated issue because it affects even horses that never saw a racetrack in their lives founder regularly from mysterious causes. ^{lvi} Horses can break their legs running across pastures with no one on their backs. ^{lvii} Whether wild or domesticated, they race with one another and often try so hard they hurt themselves. ^{lviii} They run through fences and kick each other regularly, often breaking their own legs and those of others and have to be euthanized. ^{lix} However, there is something to the complaint that the horses being raised are not as sound as they used to be. A New York Daily News reporter remarked, "The thoroughbred race horse is a genetic mistake. It runs too fast, its frame is too large, and its legs are far too small. ^{lx} As long as mankind demands that it run at high speeds under stressful conditions, horses will die at racetracks."^{lxi} Jim Squires, long time horseman and breeder of five graded stakes winners, agreed stating "the thoroughbred horse is one of the most fragile creatures on earth, an animal with a heart and a metabolism too powerful for his bones, digestive and respiratory systems, one too heavy and too strong for the structure supporting it. That condition has taken decades of evolution."^{lxii}

SOLUTIONS

"The perception of racing is that we don't care and that horses break down all the time and they're just pushed aside and 'next player,' " said Hall of Fame trainer Richard Mandella, who is active in many national and California programs involving equine welfare. ^{lxiii} "It's not. There's broken hearts that go along with it.... Nothing will ever be enough," he said. ^{lxiv} "There's no satisfaction until you've stopped it. But all I can say is there is a heck of a lot of work and good people trying to make things better."^{lxv} Jim Squires, demonstrating that admitting a problem is the first step toward fixing it, acknowledges that American thoroughbred racing demands more of its animals at an earlier age than other countries' systems do, stating "we can either make our tracks safer or continue to shock and dismay our audience and pay the consequences."^{lxvi} There are a variety of different proposed solutions, but all of them recognize that it is essential for the industry to fix the legitimate problems by investing in long-term solutions.

On October 15th 2008, the National Thoroughbred Racing Association (NTRA) announced plans for sweeping new reforms he says are the most comprehensive in the history of the sport. Ixvii The NTRA also appointed an independent counsel to review, monitor, and assess the reform program, and to provide annual public reports on the industry's progress toward its safety goals. Ixviii President of the NTRA, Alex Waldrop, stated that the first order of business would be to establish a "Code of Conduct" while further explaining "[t]his is a long term project so we want to do it right from the beginning. Ixix We want to make sure that this code of conduct is important, it is relevant and it gets to the heart of the safety issues right off the bat."Ixx

As a part of the movement toward change, the NTRA created a new organization called "Safety and Integrity Alliance," that will implement the new reforms, as well as grant certification to race tracks that comply with a package of strict new rules and regulations. Ixxi Even still, some thoroughbred owners asked Congress to clean up the horse racing industry. However, not surprisingly this idea has been met with opposition by the Jockey Club, the breed registry for the nation's thoroughbred horses, and the NTRA.Ixxii At the hearing Waldrop said "[t]he last thing this industry needs is another layer of bureaucracy." Ixxiii Alan Marzelli, president of the Jockey Club, argued that the club already formed a horse safety committee that has recommended eliminating anabolic steroids in training and racing of thoroughbreds but, under questioning, he conceded there is no way to enforce the recommendations. Ixxiv

"The real problem with the thoroughbred industry is that nobody is in charge," said Arthur Hancock. Ixxv "In my opinion, only a federal racing commission or commissioner can save us from ourselves." Ixxvi "We need Congress to take an active interest," echoed Jess Jackson, owner of Stonestreet Farms in California and Kentucky and founder of Kendall-Jackson Winery. Ixxvii All use of steroids and other drugs on thoroughbreds should be completely banned, testified owners Jackson and Hancock, veteran trainer Jack Van Berg and Richard Shapiro, chairman of the California Horse Racing Board. Ixxviii But under the industry's current configuration there is no governing body to impose such a ban, to test for the drugs, or to impose meaningful penalties for violators. Ixxix

"There are the Thoroughbred Owners and Breeders Association, The Jockey Club, the Jockey's Guild, NTRA, the Breeders' Cup, the American Horse Council, the American Association of Equine Practitioners, the Horsemen's Benevolent Protective Association, the Racing Commissioners International and the racing commissions of 38 different racing jurisdictions (states)," said Hancock. Ixxx "All of these fiefdoms have their own Nero-like CEOs." Only Congress can impose order on this chaos, he said. Ixxxi One of the horse racing industry's biggest critics, the animal protection group known as PETA, People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals, praised the NTRA's reform efforts. PETA

representative Kathy Guillermo acknowledged that PETA is pleased the NTRA is taking steps to improve race horse safety by saying “[i]f they have got many people in the industry behind them, not only the racetracks, but the owners, the trainers, and the veterinarian, and the jockeys, then I think reform is possible.” lxxxii Beyond all of the politics, in order to successfully implement change the horse racing industry must work as one toward a common goal. Thus, the deep divide between those in favor of and opposed to Congressional regulation has some in the forward thinkers within sport looking for alternative solutions.

Perhaps the finger-pointing is greatest in the debate over whether America's breeders have produced an increasingly fragile animal while making speed and brilliance the objective in a mating at the expense of soundness and durability. Doug Byars, a leading expert in internal and critical equine care, is among those who say there is too much emphasis on breeding a horse that will attract top dollar at sales with fashionable speed-oriented bloodlines rather than one who has the best parentage for longevity at the racetrack. lxxxiii “We've got to look at breeding to sell, not breeding to race,” he said. lxxxiv

Many breeders counter that they must produce what the market wants to stay in business. Also, horses such as last year's Derby winner Street Sense and runner-up Hard Spun become so valuable as stallions that the economic pressure is to retire them as three year olds. lxxxv However, if they don't race longer, no one knows if they're likely to produce progeny resilient enough to withstand several years of racing. lxxxvi Casner, chairman of the Thoroughbred Owners & Breeders Association and the owner of this year's sixth-place Derby finisher Colonel John, agrees standards are too lax for horses getting into the production chain. lxxxvii “I really don't think it's as much the speed factor as ... what does everybody do with a filly who can't run? Breed them,” he said. lxxxviii “What do they do with a filly that can't make it to the races because of soundness? Breed them. ... Horses in an earlier time had to earn their way into the breeding shed. lxxxix Fillies certainly had to be good racehorses and had to be durable. xc One industry project involves compiling statistics designed to measure the durability of stallions' offspring and allowing only the stronger horses to breed. xci

In 1948, Citation won 19 of 20 starts as a 3-year-old, including the Triple Crown, whereas recently the Kentucky Derby was won by a horse that had only raced three times and now may race only twice more, if at all. xcii In 1960, horses made an average of 11.3 starts a year but that number had dwindled to 6.31 starts in 2007, this is a dramatic drop of 44 percent that shows that the breed is becoming softer and weaker. xciii Therefore, some horsemen have begun buying thoroughbreds abroad because of the weakened bloodlines of American horses. xciv

Casner's opinion is because "we can't change genetics overnight, ... we can change our racetracks." xcv Therefore, installing synthetic surfaces at dirt tracks could have the greatest and most immediate impact to help make the racing environment safer for the horses. xcvi The Thoroughbred Owners and Breeders Association plans to release statistics soon comparing the number of fatalities at tracks before and after they installed synthetic surfaces. xcvi Casner, who applauds the California Horse Racing Board for mandating that major dirt tracks be changed to synthetic surfaces for racing by this year, issued a statement that injuries have decreased 30 to 50% after tracks switched. xcvi

However, synthetic tracks are not going to be hailed as a miracle cure all. Critics contend that while fatal bone fractures are largely reduced on synthetic tracks, there are still as many injuries and argue whether spending the same millions to simply improve dirt tracks and their drainage might have the same result. xcix Even advocates of synthetic surfaces say more needs to be learned about their maintenance, how they react in hot and cold weather and how the materials hold up over time. c

Another current debate turns on the use of anabolic steroids, both in racing and in sales.

As with human athletes, those steroids are considered performance enhancers, though they do have therapeutic value when used judiciously. Arthur Hancock points out that "[h]orses are running on drug-induced abilities as opposed to natural abilities."ci The continued breeding of animals for their enhanced performances it becomes clearer that some of the issues in the racing industry become more difficult to clean up.cii Jim Squires argued that, in order to take control of the drug issues, the industry should shift the focus of veterinary medicine and stop trying to quick-cure problems in time for a race. ciii Medications that mask injuries and weaknesses must be controlled strictly and uniformly in all racing jurisdictions, and regulators should be adequately funded by the industry if government cannot do so. civ

Thankfully, progress has been made by both state legislation and multitudes of trainers and owners that have begun refusing to drug their horses. For example, on October 1, 2008 IEAH stables headed by Michael Iavarone, was the first stable to implement a rule that no horses under its supervision will race with any medication other than Lasix.cv Ironically, this stable is home to Rick Dutrow, mentioned above for his numerous infractions for drugging his horses. Many states across the United States, such as Colorado, Indiana, Arizona, Iowa, New York, California, Washington, Pennsylvania, Delaware, Virginia, Arkansas and Illinois, have already adopted a steroid ban, restricting the use of steroids for thirty days before a race and it seems that other states like Kentucky, which had the most liberal medication policies, is following suit by adopting national guidelines that allow only bleeder medication to be given no less than four

hours before post time and only one anti-inflammatory agent be given as close as 24 hours before a race.cvi

Lastly, in an attempt to end horse slaughter in the United States, Representatives Janice Schakowsky (D-IL), Ed Whitfield (R-KY), John Spratt (D-SC) and Nick Rahall (D-WV) reintroduced in Congress H.R. 503, the American Horse Slaughter Prevention Act (AHSPA). cvii This legislation, a new version of the former American Horse Slaughter Prevention Act which was overwhelmingly passed by the House of Representatives last year but died in the Senate at the end of the 109th Congress, would prohibit permanently the slaughter of horses for human consumption as well as the exportation of live horses intended for the same purpose, making sure that no American horse is slaughtered in the US nor shipped to be slaughtered abroad. cviii

Recently, the federal court upheld a longstanding [Texas state law](#) banning the sale, possession and transportation of horse meat for sale for human consumption. cix Another federal court removed funding for mandatory USDA ante-mortem inspections of horses for slaughter.cx While both of these rulings forced the closure of the three horse slaughterhouses operating the United States, American horses continue to be exported for slaughter to Canada and Mexico. cxii The horse slaughter industry is currently attempting to repeal the Texas state law banning horse slaughter. cxiii On April 28, 2009 Montana's Governor Schweitzer still has not decided on a slaughterhouse bill that would allow horse slaughter in the state of Montana. cxiii The Governor has ten days to veto it, if he makes no action then the bill will become law.cxiv This makes the passage of the American Horse Slaughter Prevention Act (H.R. 503 and S. 311) extremely important since it would not only prevent American horses from being sent for slaughter abroad but also would put a definitive, permanent end to horse slaughter in the United States.

When asked about the problem of overbreeding Alex Brown, a 20 year horseman, exercise rider, and animal welfare activist, stated "[m]any argue that the root cause of "unwanted horses" is irresponsible breeding. Certainly I think we do have some reckless breeding practices that are designed to seek out the one big win versus worrying about the life cycle of all horses bred. To that end, I think breeders should take more responsibility of horses that they have bred, which could manifest in some kind of "tax" which goes to an escrow account that supports retiring horses and humane euthanasia programs."cxv Anti-slaughter activists echo Brown's opinion by focusing on rehabilitation and re-homing of retired racehorses through a four part plan. cxvi First, a robust humane euthanasia and disposal solution on a state-by-state basis should be implemented. cxvii Humane euthanasia programs can be in place at horse auctions as well as horse rescues. cxviii Second, additional resources to create incentives for horse rescues to absorb more horses that can either be retired or rehabilitated need to be identified. cxix Third, the demand for horse meat needs to be attacked with a marketing campaign that illustrates that horses are not fit for human consumption, according to the

drugs that each horse has been administered over its lifetime. cxx Finally, a necessary component of everything going forward should be education because breeders and horse owners need to for more responsible horse management. cxxi

To fund this plan, the group argues that breed programs can attach a surcharge when a horse is registered to the breed. cxxii The tire industry, in an effort to control its waste, adds a surcharge for each new tire sold in order to pay for recycling the tire when it is not longer useful. cxxiii Such a program will be economically insignificant compared to the \$US39 billion a year (\$US102 billion indirectly) that the horse industry generates. cxxiv A surcharge can also be applied each time a horse changes ownership and this change is registered with the horse's breed registry. cxxv Racetracks can also continue developing programs that support their athletes. For example, Belmont Park, Churchill Downs, Pimlico and Delaware Park have all began seeking accreditation from the National Thoroughbred Racing Association Safety and Integrity Alliance and some racetracks have set aside stalls for retired horses. cxxvi Lastly, Racing jurisdictions can develop programs for the retirement of horses that ran within their state. cxxvii California is an example: .3% of purses distributed in California are earmarked for horse retirement and rehabilitation and this money is distributed by California Retirement Management Account (CARMA). cxxviii

CONCLUSION

When a driver dies in car racing, or a fighter in boxing, those sports owe it to their participants and fans to examine the reasons why the accident occurred and see if significant changes can be made to diminish the odds of further injuries. cxxix That, however, is where the similarities end between horse racing and other sports. cxxx When a pro football player breaks his leg, the bone is set and the leg is placed in a cast. cxxxi No one calls for the sport to be banned. But because of the musculoskeletal system of the horse, too often the injured limbs cannot be repaired and unfortunately require euthanasia instead horse racing is viewed much differently. cxxxii The negativity surrounding the industry is a wake-up call to all horsemen that thoroughbred horse racing can no longer hide the “dirty little secrets” that have been part of our history.

The problems in the racing industry are not new, but with the industry now under a microscope—from the press, the public, and possibly federal regulators—owners, breeders, trainers, jockeys, veterinarians, and researchers will need to continue to debate the issues facing racing with more urgency. cxxxiii Unwanted horses cannot continually be seen as an inconvenient problem for "someone else" to deal with. cxxxiv Horse racing can't afford to lose lifelong fans, and turn off prospective new followers, with each televised injury. cxxxv No longer can "professional courtesy" be extended to those amongst us who betray the trust of their charges, whether it's neglect of horses or

poor treatment of stable help. cxxxvi The thoroughbred horse is one of the world's most magnificent and willing creatures, and unfortunately, self-destructive enough by nature. cxxxvii They don't need all this help from those of us who love them. cxxxviii

Perhaps Tim Vana summarized my current feelings best in his editorial for the Illinois Racing News when he eloquently said, "[i]t is my experience that the vast majority of people in Racing try their best every day to win the right way. They try to act in the best interests of the horses, and they treat other people with respect. They work very hard in pursuit of dreams that are elusive by definition, and in the process define themselves as people of discipline, people for whom having the courage of their own convictions is a way of life. I am proud to be associated with such people."cxxxix While I still love the sport of horse racing, I am no longer naïve to the reality of the situation around me. Some people might learn of the horrors within the community they are a part of and begin to walk away. However, I have a chance, by continuing in this industry to become a voice for the beautiful, intelligent, loving athletes I love and cherish. Now more than ever, I plan to immerse myself into the culture of racing to help propel horse racing into a new era based on humane treatment and respect for our equine companions and I urge those with similar viewpoints to join me.

ⁱ Oscar Otis, *New Turf Champion Acclaimed for Great Comeback*, The Los Angeles Times, (March 3, 1940).

ⁱⁱ Dr. Patricia Hogan, *Putting the Horse First?*, http://cs.bloodhorse.com/blogs/finalturn/archive/2009/03/10/Putting-the-Horse-First_3F00_.aspx (Posted March 10, 2009, 9:12 AM)

ⁱⁱⁱ Dr. Patricia Hogan, *Putting the Horse First?*, http://cs.bloodhorse.com/blogs/finalturn/archive/2009/03/10/Putting-the-Horse-First_3F00_.aspx (Posted March 10, 2009, 9:12 AM)

^{iv} Dr. Patricia Hogan, *Putting the Horse First?*, http://cs.bloodhorse.com/blogs/finalturn/archive/2009/03/10/Putting-the-Horse-First_3F00_.aspx (Posted March 10, 2009, 9:12 AM)

^v Dr. Patricia Hogan, *Putting the Horse First?*, http://cs.bloodhorse.com/blogs/finalturn/archive/2009/03/10/Putting-the-Horse-First_3F00_.aspx (Posted March 10, 2009, 9:12 AM)

^{vi} *Id.*

^{vii} *Id.*

^{viii} *Id.*

^{ix} Can horseracing solve its problems in time to survive? <http://cs.bloodhorse.com/blogs/scot/archive/2009/04/12/can-thoroughbred-horse-racing-solve-its-problems-in-time-to-survive.aspx> (April 12, 2009).

^x Jim Squires, *So where does horseracing go from here?*, <http://www.nytimes.com/2008/05/05/sports/othersports/05rail.html> (May 5, 2008).

^{xi} Steve Haskin, *Eight Belles' Gift to Seabiscuit Author*, <http://www.bloodhorse.com/horse-racing/articles/45135/eight-belles-gift-to-seabiscuit-author> (May 10, 2008).

-
- ^{xii} *Calls for reform: HSUS Experts weigh in on horse racing*.
http://www.hsus.org/horses_equines/news/experts_horse_racing_051508.html (May 15, 2008).
- ^{xiii} Dan Liebman, *Healing the wounds*, <http://cs.bloodhorse.com/blogs/wgoh/archive/2008/05/13/Healing-the-Wounds.aspx> (May 13, 2008).
- ^{xiv} Dan Liebman, *Healing the wounds*, <http://cs.bloodhorse.com/blogs/wgoh/archive/2008/05/13/Healing-the-Wounds.aspx> (May 13, 2008).
- ^{xv} *Id.* at http://www.hsus.org/horses_equines/news/experts_horse_racing_051508.html
- ^{xvi} Glenn Robertson Smith, *Why Racehorses Are Cracking Up*, *The Age* (Australia) (November 15, 2002).
- ^{xvii} Raeleann Smith, *Advocacy for Animals, Horse Racing: Stop It (or At Least Reform It)*, <http://advocacy.britannica.com/blog/advocacy/2008/06/horse-racing-stop-it-or-at-least-reform-it/> (June 2nd, 2008)
- ^{xviii} Ted Miller, *Six Recent Horse Deaths at Emerald Downs Spark Concern*, *Seattle Post-Intelligencer* (May 8, 2001).
- ^{xix} *Id.* at Ted Miller
- ^{xx} *Id.* at <http://advocacy.britannica.com/blog/advocacy/2008/06/horse-racing-stop-it-or-at-least-reform-it/>
- ^{xxi} *Id.*
- ^{xxii} *Id.*
- ^{xxiii} John Scheinman, *Horses, Drugs Are Racing's Daily Double; No Uniform Policy in Industry*, *The Washington Post* (April 27, 2003).
- ^{xxiv} Alex Straus, *Dark Horses*, *Maxim* (May 2002).
- ^{xxv} *Id.* at John Scheinman,
- ^{xxvi} Peat Bee, *Cut the Poppycock and Treat Drugs With Horse Sense*, *The Guardian* (January 13, 2003)
- ^{xxvii} *Id.* at <http://advocacy.britannica.com/blog/advocacy/2008/06/horse-racing-stop-it-or-at-least-reform-it/>
- ^{xxviii} Bill Finley, *In Horse Racing, Test of Beefed-Up Champions*, *The New York Times* (June 2, 2008)
- ^{xxix} *Id.* at Bill Finley, *In Horse Racing, Test of Beefed-Up Champions*
- ^{xxx} *Id.* at Bill Finley, *In Horse Racing, Test of Beefed-Up Champions*
- ^{xxxi} *Id.* at Bill Finley, *In Horse Racing, Test of Beefed-Up Champions*
- ^{xxxii} *Id.* at <http://advocacy.britannica.com/blog/advocacy/2008/06/horse-racing-stop-it-or-at-least-reform-it/>
- ^{xxxiii} Andrew Beyer, *A Beyer's Guide for Racehorses*, *The Washington Post* (June 3, 2003).
- ^{xxxiv} William C. Rhoden, *An Unknown Filly Dies, and the Crowd Just Shrugs*, *The New York Times* May 25 2006.
- ^{xxxv} *Id.* at William C. Rhoden

^{xxxvi} *Id.* at William C. Rhoden

^{xxxvii} *Id.* at William C. Rhoden

^{xxxviii} Tim Reynolds, *Technology Can't Prevent Horse Injuries*, The Lexington Herald-Leader (August 30 2001).

^{xxxix} John Packett, *Track Trauma: Sesamoid Bone Injuries Are Common and a Leading Cause of Death at Colonial Downs*, Richmond Times-Dispatch (July 19 2007).

^{xl} *Id.* at John Packett,

^{xli} *Esther Marr, Zito, Jackson, Hancock Discuss Horse Slaughter Issue*, <http://www.bloodhorse.com/horse-racing/articles/33920/zito-jackson-hancock-discuss-horse-slaughter-issue> (last updated June 8, 2006, 4:11pm)

^{xlii} *Esther Marr, Zito, Jackson, Hancock Discuss Horse Slaughter Issue*, <http://www.bloodhorse.com/horse-racing/articles/33920/zito-jackson-hancock-discuss-horse-slaughter-issue> (last updated June 8, 2006, 4:11pm)

^{xliii} Bill Heller, *After the Finish Line: The Race to End Horse Slaughter in America* (BowTie Press 2005).

^{xliv} *Id.* at Bill Heller

^{xlv} *Id.* at <http://www.bloodhorse.com/horse-racing/articles/33920/zito-jackson-hancock-discuss-horse-slaughter-issue>

^{xlvi} *Id.* at <http://www.bloodhorse.com/horse-racing/articles/33920/zito-jackson-hancock-discuss-horse-slaughter-issue>

^{xlvii} *Id.* at <http://www.bloodhorse.com/horse-racing/articles/33920/zito-jackson-hancock-discuss-horse-slaughter-issue>.

^{xlviii} *Id.* at <http://www.bloodhorse.com/horse-racing/articles/33920/zito-jackson-hancock-discuss-horse-slaughter-issue>

^{xlix} PETA, *The Horseracing Industry: Drugs, Deception and Death* <http://www.peta.org/factsheet/files/FactsheetDisplay.asp?ID=65>

¹ *Id.* at <http://www.peta.org/factsheet/files/FactsheetDisplay.asp?ID=65>

ⁱⁱ *Id.* at <http://www.peta.org/factsheet/files/FactsheetDisplay.asp?ID=65>

ⁱⁱⁱ *Id.* at <http://www.peta.org/factsheet/files/FactsheetDisplay.asp?ID=65>

ⁱⁱⁱⁱ *Id.* at <http://www.peta.org/factsheet/files/FactsheetDisplay.asp?ID=65>

^{lv} *Id.* at <http://www.peta.org/factsheet/files/FactsheetDisplay.asp?ID=65>

^{lv} *Id.* at <http://www.bloodhorse.com/horse-racing/articles/33920/zito-jackson-hancock-discuss-horse-slaughter-issue>

^{lvi} *Id.* at Bill Finley, *Sadly, No Way to Stop Deaths*

^{lvii} Bill Finley, *Sadly, No Way to Stop Deaths*, New York Daily News (June 10, 1993).

^{lviii} *Id.* at Bill Finley, *Sadly, No Way to Stop Deaths*

^{lix} *Id.* at Bill Finley, *Sadly, No Way to Stop Deaths*

^{lx} *Id.* at Bill Finley, *Sadly, No Way to Stop Deaths*

^{lxi} *Id.* at Bill Finley, *Sadly, No Way to Stop Deaths*

^{lxii} *Id.* at <http://www.nytimes.com/2008/05/05/sports/othersports/05rail.html>

^{lxiii} Jennie Rees and Gregory A. Hall, *The (Louisville) Courier-Journal, Breeding, betting and dirt at issue in horse racing reform (Updated May19, 2008 6:00 PM)*

^{lxiv} *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{lxv} *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{lxvi} *Id.* at <http://www.nytimes.com/2008/05/05/sports/othersports/05rail.html>

^{lxvii} Teresa Sullivan, *US Horse Racing Group to Introduce New Safety Reforms (October 24, 2008).*

^{lxviii} *Id.* at Sullivan

^{lxix} *Id.* at Sullivan

^{lxx} *Id.* at Sullivan

^{lxxi} *Id.* at Sullivan

^{lxxii} Bob Dart, Cox News Service, *Some in Horse Racing Industry Call For Federal Regulation*
http://www.coxwashington.com/news/content/reporters/stories/2008/06/19/2008/07/17/HORSE_RACING20_COX.html , (Released June 19, 2008).

^{lxxiii} *Id.* at
http://www.coxwashington.com/news/content/reporters/stories/2008/06/19/2008/07/17/HORSE_RACING20_COX.html

^{lxxiv} *Id.* at
http://www.coxwashington.com/news/content/reporters/stories/2008/06/19/2008/07/17/HORSE_RACING20_COX.html

^{lxxv} *Id.* at
http://www.coxwashington.com/news/content/reporters/stories/2008/06/19/2008/07/17/HORSE_RACING20_COX.html

^{lxxvi} *Id.* at
http://www.coxwashington.com/news/content/reporters/stories/2008/06/19/2008/07/17/HORSE_RACING20_COX.html

^{lxxvii} *Id.* at
http://www.coxwashington.com/news/content/reporters/stories/2008/06/19/2008/07/17/HORSE_RACING20_COX.html

^{lxxviii} *Id.* at
http://www.coxwashington.com/news/content/reporters/stories/2008/06/19/2008/07/17/HORSE_RACING20_COX.html

^{lxxix} *Id.* at
http://www.coxwashington.com/news/content/reporters/stories/2008/06/19/2008/07/17/HORSE_RACING20_COX.html

^{lxxx} *Id.* at
http://www.coxwashington.com/news/content/reporters/stories/2008/06/19/2008/07/17/HORSE_RACING20_COX.html

^{lxxx}_i *Id.* at
http://www.coxwashington.com/news/content/reporters/stories/2008/06/19/2008/07/17/HORSE_RACING20_COX.html

^{lxxx}_{ii} *Id.* at Sullivan

^{lxxx}_{iii} *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{lxxx}_{iv} *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{lxxx}_v *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{lxxx}_{vi} *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{lxxx}_{vii} *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{lxxx}_{viii} *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{lxxx}_{ix} *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{xc} *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{xc}_i *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{xc}_{ii} *Id.* at
http://www.coxwashington.com/news/content/reporters/stories/2008/06/19/2008/07/17/HORSE_RACING20_COX.html

^{xc}_{iii} *Id.* at
http://www.coxwashington.com/news/content/reporters/stories/2008/06/19/2008/07/17/HORSE_RACING20_COX.html

^{xc}_{iv} *Id.* at
http://www.coxwashington.com/news/content/reporters/stories/2008/06/19/2008/07/17/HORSE_RACING20_COX.html

^{xc}_v *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{xc}_{vi} *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{xc}_{vii} *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{xc}_{viii} *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^{xc}_{ix} *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

^c *Id.* at Rees and Hall.

-
- ^{ci} *Id. at Rees and Hall.*
- ^{cii} *Id. at Rees and Hall.*
- ^{ciii} *Id. at <http://www.nytimes.com/2008/05/05/sports/othersports/05rail.html>*
- ^{civ} *Id. at <http://www.nytimes.com/2008/05/05/sports/othersports/05rail.html>*
- ^{cv} Steve Haskin, *IEAH Stables Adopts No-Drug Policy*, <http://www.bloodhorse.com/horse-racing/articles/45841/ieah-stables-adopts-no-drug-policy> (last updated June 25, 2008, 3:37pm)
- ^{cvi} *Id. at Rees and Hall.*
- ^{cvii} Habitat for horses, *American Horse Slaughter Prevention Act*, <http://www.habitatforhorses.org/joincampaigns/ahspa.html> (2009).
- ^{cviii} *Id. at <http://www.habitatforhorses.org/joincampaigns/ahspa.html>*
- ^{cix} *Id. at <http://www.habitatforhorses.org/joincampaigns/ahspa.html>*
- ^{cx} *Id. at <http://www.habitatforhorses.org/joincampaigns/ahspa.html>*
- ^{cxii} *Id. at <http://www.habitatforhorses.org/joincampaigns/ahspa.html>*
- ^{cxiii} KFBB news team. *Session ends, horse slaughter bill still in question.* (April 28,2009).
- ^{cxiv} *Id. at KFBB news team*
- ^{cxv} Alex Brown, Bloodhorse, *Talkin' Horses*, <http://www.bloodhorse.com/talkinhorses/AB062608.asp> (June 26, 2008).
- ^{cxvi} Caroline Betts, *Sensible debate over unwanted horses would help anti-slaughter lobby*, <http://www.horsetalk.co.nz/features/horseslaughter-152.shtml> (May 27, 2008).
- ^{cxvii} *Id. at <http://www.horsetalk.co.nz/features/horseslaughter-152.shtml>*
- ^{cxviii} *Id. at <http://www.horsetalk.co.nz/features/horseslaughter-152.shtml>*
- ^{cxix} *Id. at <http://www.horsetalk.co.nz/features/horseslaughter-152.shtml>*
- ^{cxx} *Id. at <http://www.horsetalk.co.nz/features/horseslaughter-152.shtml>*
- ^{cxxi} *Id. at <http://www.horsetalk.co.nz/features/horseslaughter-152.shtml>*
- ^{cxxii} *Id. at <http://www.horsetalk.co.nz/features/horseslaughter-152.shtml>*
- ^{cxxiii} *Id. at <http://www.horsetalk.co.nz/features/horseslaughter-152.shtml>*
- ^{cxxiv} *Id. at <http://www.horsetalk.co.nz/features/horseslaughter-152.shtml>*
- ^{cxxv} *Id. at <http://www.horsetalk.co.nz/features/horseslaughter-152.shtml>*

^{cxxvi} Tom LaMarra. *Delaware Park Latest Track to Seek Accreditation*, Bloodhorse Magazine 1054 (March 21, 2009).

^{cxxvii} *Id.* at <http://www.horsetalk.co.nz/features/horseslaughter-152.shtml>

^{cxxviii} *Id.* at <http://www.horsetalk.co.nz/features/horseslaughter-152.shtml>

^{cxxix} *Id.* at Lieberman

^{cxxx} *Id.* at Lieberman

^{cxxxi} *Id.* at Lieberman

^{cxxxii} *Id.* at Lieberman

^{cxxxiii} *Id. at Lieberman*

^{cxxxiv} *Id.* at Dr. Hogan

^{cxxxv} *Id.* at Dr. Hogan

^{cxxxvi} *Id.* at Dr. Hogan

^{cxxxvii} *Id.* at Dr. Hogan

^{cxxxviii} *Id.* at Dr. Hogan

^{cxxxix} Tim Vana, *A Thoroughbred Owner's Perspective*. Illinois racing news 19 (April 2009).